



BARRY KEEL
Chief Executive
Floor 1 - Civic Centre
Plymouth
PL1 2AA

www.plymouth.gov.uk/democracy
www.swdwp.co.uk

Date 20/07/11 Telephone Enquiries 01752 307990 Fax 01752 304819
Please ask for Ross Johnston, Democratic Support Officer e-mail ross.johnston@plymouth.gov.uk

SOUTH WEST DEVON WASTE PARTNERSHIP

DATE: THURSDAY 28 JULY 2011
TIME: 10AM
PLACE: OLDWAY MANSION, TORQUAY

Members –

Councillors Ian Bowyer, Croad, Hart, Michael Leaves, Thomas and Tyerman.

Observers Members –

Councillors Black, Doggett and Vincent.

Members are invited to attend the above meeting to consider the items of business overleaf

BARRY KEEL
CHIEF EXECUTIVE

SOUTH WEST DEVON WASTE PARTNERSHIP

1. APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

Barry Keel will invite nominations for a new Committee Chair in accordance with the Joint Working Agreement and a new Chair will be elected. The new Chair will invite nominations for a new Committee Vice-Chair in accordance with the Joint Working Agreement and a new Vice-Chair will be elected.

2. INTRODUCTIONS AND APOLOGIES

To introduce attendees and receive apologies for non-attendance submitted by Members.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members will be asked to make any declarations of interest in respect of items on this agenda.

4. MINUTES

(Pages 1 - 6)

To sign and confirm as a correct record the minutes of the meeting held on 7 April 2011.

5. CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS

To receive reports on business which, in the opinion of the Chair, should be brought forward for urgent consideration.

6. PROJECT UPDATE

Members will receive an update on the project from Mark Turner, Project Director.

7. OVERVIEW OF PROJECT COMMUNICATIONS

(Pages 7 - 10)

Members to receive a report on communication activity from April 2011 to July 2011 and a summary of the written queries received in the last three months from members of the public.

8. OVERVIEW OF MVV'S ENERGY FROM WASTE PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENT PERMIT APPLICATIONS

Members will receive an overview presentation on MVV's North Yard Energy from Waste planning and environmental permit applications from Paul Carey, Managing Director of MVV Environmental Devonport Ltd.

9. PROJECT PROGRAMME AND NEXT STEPS (Pages 11 - 12)

Members will receive the latest project programme from Mark Turner.

10. DATE AND LOCATION OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting is scheduled for 27 October 2011 at 10am in Plymouth at the Council House, Armada Way, Plymouth.

11. EXEMPT BUSINESS

To consider passing a resolution under Section 100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972 to exclude the press and public from the meeting for the following item(s) of business on the grounds that it (they) involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph(s) of Part I of Schedule 12A of the Act, as amended by the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

PART II (PRIVATE MEETING)

AGENDA

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO NOTE

that under the law, the committee is entitled to consider certain items in private. Members of the public will be asked to leave the meeting when such items are discussed.

Nil.

This page is intentionally left blank

South West Devon Waste Partnership

Thursday 7 April 2011

PRESENT:

Councillor Butt, in the Chair.
Councillor Michael Leaves, Vice Chair.
Councillors Bowyer, Croad and Hart.

Observer Members: Councillor Doggett

Apologies for absence: Councillor Vincent

Also in attendance: Mark Turner – Project Director, Martin Pollard – Project Manager, Anthony Payne – Director for Development and Regeneration (Plymouth City Council), Ben Jennings – County Waste Manager (Devon County Council), Ian Harrison – Deputy Executive Director of Environment and Culture (Devon County Council), Sally Farley – Service Manager (Torbay Council), Charles Uzzell – Environment Commissioner (Torbay Council), Paul Carey – Managing Director, MVV Environmental Devonport Ltd, Niranjana Patel – Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, Rachel Galbraith – PFI Co-ordinator and Ross Johnston – Democratic Support Officer.

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 3.10 pm.

Note: At a future meeting, the committee will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

38. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest.

39. **MINUTES**

Agreed that the minutes of the meeting of the South West Devon Waste Partnership Joint Committee held on Thursday 16 December 2010 are confirmed as a correct record.

40. **CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS**

There were no items of Chair's Urgent business.

41. **PROJECT UPDATE**

The Partnership received a Project Update report from Mark Turner, Project Director. Members were informed that –

- (a) in January 2011 it was announced that MVV Umwelt had been approved as the preferred bidder;
- (b) the Final Business Case was finalised and signed off by the three authorities Cabinet's in early February and subsequently submitted to the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA);
- (c) DEFRA approved the Final Business Case in late March and confirmed the award of £95M PFI credits;
- (d) the contract was finalised and signed by the partnership and MVV Umwelt on 25 March 2011 following an intensive week of final negotiations in London;
- (e) MVV were now finalising the planning application for submission.

Agreed that the Partnership convey its special thanks for all the hard work dedicated to the project and the intensive final negotiations by Mark Turner, Project Director and Martin Pollard, Project Manager and all of the wider partnership team involved.

42. **OVERVIEW OF PROJECT COMMUNICATIONS**

Mark Turner, Project Director presented a report on recent and upcoming communication activity. Members were informed that –

- (a) there had been many communication activities over the past three months which included –
 - meetings with Incineration is Wrong (IIW);
 - MP's briefings;
 - all councillor briefings;
 - nine public roadshows;
 - stakeholder briefings;
 - dockyard staff briefing;
 - meeting with Affinity Sutton Housing Association;
- (b) there had been an increased public interest over the past three months with 56 written queries being received since January 2011; all of them had been answered;
- (c) at the Guildhall roadshow there was a protest march which was attended by approximately 200 people.

Following questions by members it was reported that –

- (d) the roadshow in Buckfastleigh was organised solely through MVV and did not include the Partnership and hence had been modified from the other roadshows to incorporate a section about the Buckfastleigh Ash Recycling facility, a site where bottom ash would be processed;
- (e) MVV would be the applicant submitting the planning application.

43. **MVV'S ENERGY FROM WASTE SOLUTION - BACKGROUND AND TECHNICAL OVERVIEW**

The Partnership received a presentation from Paul Carey, Managing Director of MVV Environmental Devonport Ltd about MVV Umwelt and MVV Environment. The presentation also included detail on their Energy from Waste solution at North Yard, Devonport. Members were advised that –

- (a) MVV Energie was the parent company of MVV Umwelt, a waste management, Combined Heat and Power (CHP) and biomass company. MVV Umwelt were the German parent company of MVV Environment, a UK based Waste Management company who had created a subsidiary company, MVV Environment Devonport Ltd;
- (b) MVV Environment Devonport Ltd were the company selected as the preferred bidder by the SWDWP and officially signed the contract with the partnership on 25 March 2011;
- (c) MVV Umwelt had worked in Energy from Waste (EfW) for over 45 years having created their first EfW and CHP plant in Mannheim, Germany in 1965;
- (d) MVV Environment Devonport Ltd was committed to create an efficient, sustainable and innovative waste solution in Devon and this was fully supported by MVV Energie;
- (e) MVV Environment Devonport Ltd offered a sustainable and deliverable solution which aimed to provide a long term waste management solution over 25 – 40 years with a highly efficient CHP facility;
- (f) the solution would be situated in the North Yard, Devonport and would provide CHP as soon as it was operational;
- (g) an agreement was in place to provide heat and energy to the Ministry of Defence (MOD) for 25 years;

- (h) the site location was close to a major road network, which would ensure that once the facility was operational the traffic impact in the area would be minimised;
- (i) MVV considered the proposed site was in compliance with local planning policies and MVV aimed to improve the local community by developing Blackie's Wood into a nature reserve;
- (j) the plant had the capacity to manage 245,000 tonnes of waste per annum and deliver a highly efficient production of energy and heat;
- (k) KIER Group, building and civil engineering contractor would construct the building, which would use modern aesthetic architecture;
- (l) when in operation the plant would be environmentally compliant and would be significantly below the mandatory safe emission levels, additionally the plant's emissions would be published daily on MVV's website;
- (m) the solution offered by MVV Environment Devonport Ltd was a very cost effective deal for the SWDWP and was, in fact, £388.8m below the partnership's reference case estimate;
- (n) the reason for the cost effectiveness of the solution was due to MVV Environment Devonport Ltd using other sources of income including, amongst other things, heat and power revenues from the MOD, power revenues from the National Grid and income from processing commercial and industrial waste;
- (o) the next stage in the process was for MVV Environment Devonport Ltd to submit a planning application in spring 2011; as part of this process MVV had held pre-application consultations with local residents, stakeholders, Planning Officers and briefed the Environment Agency;
- (p) the solution would not only manage the Partnership's waste but MVV would seek to build trusting relationships with local communities, deliver jobs, economic benefits and offer training and educational opportunities;
- (q) MVV Environment Devonport Ltd had already started to develop relationships with local communities by establishing a Local Liaison Committee which met on 31 March 2011; these relationships would continue, assuming planning permission was granted, during the construction and operation of the facility.

In response to questions it was reported that –

- (r) when the facility was shut down for maintenance, the waste would be baled and stored; typically the facility could store waste like this for approximately one month;
- (s) the planning application was still being finalised as changes to the architecture design and other studies were being finalised and was hoped to be submitted soon but would not be available publicly until registered – likely sometime in May;
- (t) rail and marine facilities to transport waste were not part of the current solution but the possibility to use these transport methods would be looked at in the future. MVV had experience of these transport methods in Germany;
- (u) the Local Liaison Committee had met informally but did not yet include any councillors although the public members did request whether a councillor, such as Plymouth City Council's Cabinet Member for Community Services (Street Scene, Waste and Sustainability), could sit on the committee at future meetings.

The Chair thanked Paul Carey, Managing Director of MVV Environmental Devonport Ltd, for his attendance and the detailed presentation.

44. **DATE AND LOCATION OF NEXT MEETING**

Agreed that the next meeting will be held on Thursday 28 July 2011 in Torbay at a venue and time to be confirmed.

45. **EXEMPT BUSINESS**

Agreed that, under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act, 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Act, as amended by the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

46. **MVV'S ENERGY FROM WASTE SOLUTION - COMMERCIAL AND FINANCIAL OVERVIEW (E3)**

The Partnership received a presentation from Paul Carey, Managing Director of MVV Environmental Devonport Ltd about MVV Umwelt and MVV Environment. The presentation also included detail on their Energy from Waste solution at North Yard, Devonport Dockyard.

(See minute 43 above).

47. **PROJECT PROCUREMENT PROGRAMME AND NEXT STEPS (E3)**

Mark Turner, Project Director presented the latest procurement programme. Members were informed that –

- (a) the procurement phase had been concluded following the contract award to MVV Umwelt on 25 March 2011 and the programme had now entered the planning and delivery phase;
- (b) the next project programme would include updated milestones to reflect key features of the planning and delivery phase;
- (c) the programme remained on target for operational commencement in 2014.

Agreed that the latest procurement programme is noted.



South West Devon Waste Partnership Community Engagement Report – July 2011

MVV Umwelt's solution proposes a 245,000 tonne per annum capacity energy from waste facility located in North Yard, HM Naval Base Devonport, which is in the Weston Mill area of the Naval Base bordering Blackies Wood. The facility will be a combined heat and power plant providing environmentally sustainable electrical energy and heat to HM Naval Base Devonport.

MVV submitted its planning application to the Plymouth City Council Planning department in May 2011. The company has also applied for an environmental permit through the Environment Agency which was declared duly made in June 2011.

Provided planning and permitting approval is granted as scheduled, construction of the plant will begin in 2012, with operations commencing in 2014.

This report provides a summary of project related communication activities and written queries made between 08 April 2011 and 20 July 2011.

1. Communication activities

The **Incinerator Liaison Committee (ILC)** has been set up and 3 meetings have taken place so far in March, May and June. These meetings are attended by representatives from SWDWP, MVV, the Ministry of Defence and the Environment Agency. This committee was initially known as the Local Liaison Committee whoever a similarly named committee already exists linked to Devonport Naval Base so the name was changed.

11 April – **Plymouth Chamber of Commerce briefing.** The partnership along with MVV were invited by the Chamber of Commerce to present an update on the project and overview MVV's proposed long-term waste solution.

27 May – **MP briefing.** MPs were invited to a briefing on the project in the Council House in Plymouth; Alison Seabeck attended with Gary Streeter and Oliver Colville sending their apologies. South West Devon Waste Partnership provided an overview of the proposed North Yard solution and the planning application submitted by MVV.

The partnership also gave a separate briefing to Nick Harvey MP and Minister for Armed Forces at the Castle Centre in Barnstaple.

2 / 3 June – **All Councillor briefings.** Members of Devon County Council, Plymouth City Council and Torbay Council were invited to briefings in their area. These were held in the Council Chamber in Plymouth, Larkbeare House in Exeter and the Town Hall in Torbay. MVV also attended and provided an overview of their solution and the submitted planning application.

07 June – 16 June – **Exhibitions.** MVV held a series of public exhibitions in June 2011 in conjunction with SWDWP. These were held in 9 venues across Plymouth, Saltash and Ivybridge and approximately 450 people attended. MVV advertised the events in the local print and broadcast media along with libraries, shops and other public venues. MVV also published and sent over 20,000 newsletters directly to local residents notifying them of these exhibitions and updating them on the project and planning application.

Initial analysis shows that attendance at the exhibitions was lower than previously with 53 comment forms returned over the course of the events. Key concerns on the forms reflected previous exhibitions with traffic, emissions and impact on health, noise and appearance being the main issues. The appropriateness of the technology has also been questioned; MVV will seek to address these issues in future communications. A more detailed comparison of the exhibitions is provided in appendix 1.

IIW were invited and attended all exhibition events with a display setting out their main objections to the proposal. IIW also organised a demonstration and march outside the Guild Hall to coincide with the MVV exhibition there which was attended by around 30-40 people.

A class from Riverside Community Primary School attended the Tamar View Community Centre event before it was opened to the public. An officer from MVV and the Partnership talked the school children through the proposals.

17 June – **Dockyard staff briefing.** MVV and the Partnership held a briefing for workers within the Dockyard to provide information on the project.

05 July - **CHP Presentation** to professional associations of surveyors and energy assessors at Moorlands Links

08 July – **Presentation** to Torquay Boys Grammar School at the MVV office from MVV and the partnership. This allowed the 6th form pupils to see both the exhibition and 3D model available to the general public alongside receiving a detailed presentation on the North Yard project from the MVV planning manager.

2 Summary of written queries received

20 written queries have been received. The main concerns are around emissions, traffic, cost of the solution, the democratic process, ash produced and noise/light pollution. The partnership has responded to the all written queries received.

3. Media Enquiries and Liaison

Enquiries have continued to come in from various sources: Plymouth Herald, Heart Radio, BBC Spotlight and Radio Devon, who covered the exhibitions in considerable detail. The signing of the agreement for the Exeter energy from waste plant also generated some enquiries; coverage was focused on the county perspective rather than individual projects. The postponement of Devon County Council's planning committee to consider Viridor's planning application also sparked some media interest, but it was predominantly linked to the planning process rather than the partnership's current situation.

The partnership has been supporting MVV to write letters to the Herald to address some of the key and frequent concerns that arise in the letters page such as emissions, health and transport issues. In addition, the opportunity for the partnership to give a limited response (where appropriate) to some letters has been agreed with the Herald, so that both perspectives are printed simultaneously.



Appendix 1

Exhibition Comparisons Feb 2011 / June 2011

Attendance

Compared to the exhibitions in Feb 2011 attendance in June dropped by around 71%.

910 individuals attended the exhibitions in Feb and 268 in Jun ¹

For the individual venues there was a significant % drop in attendance as detailed below:

<u>Venue</u>	<u>Feb 2011</u>	<u>June 2011</u>	<u>% Drop</u>
Weston Mill Primary	96	46	52.08%
Watermark Ivybridge	40	8	80.00%
Gaynor Hall Keyham	51	13	74.51%
Guildhall Plymouth	339	60	82.30%
Community Centre Barne Barton	79	20	74.68%
Community Centre St Budeaux	215	89	58.60%
Main Hall Torpoint	50	12	76.60%
Community Centre / Guildhall Saltash	40	20	50.00%

Feedback

Only 14.9% of the attendees gave any feedback compared to 27.6% in the Feb exhibitions.

The main areas of feedback across both set of exhibitions both written and verbal were as follows:

- Traffic
- Impact of emissions on health
- Odour / Noise / Light pollution
- Visual impact
- Use of technology
- Ash disposal / transport of ash

These issues have been consistent across the duration of the project and were also identified as areas of concern prior to specific site selection.

Dockyard Briefings

Attendance at the dockyard briefings increased by almost 58%. There were 57 attendees in February and 90 in June.

Feedback forms were handed in by 12% of attendees in Feb and 4.4% in June.

Dockyard briefings are voluntary which indicates an increase in interest around the project and its potential impact within the North Yard and the dockyard in general.

¹ Figures exclude briefings held in the dockyard – please see section on dockyard for further information

This page is intentionally left blank

South West Devon Waste Partnership
Latest Project Programme – 14th July 2011

Milestone	FBC Programme Feb 2011	Current agreed/ <i>anticipated</i> programme	Status	Comments
Finalise Contract	Mar 2011	Mar 2011	Completed Mar 11	Finalise Contract for award
Defra Approve FBC	Feb 2011	Mar 2011	Completed 25 Mar 2011	Defra FBC process & approval
Contract Award and Final Close	Mar 2011	Mar 2011	Completed 25 Mar 2011	25 th March 2011
MVV Submit Planning application	Mar 2011	15th April 2011	Completed May 10th 2011	Delayed due to MVV finalisation of planning application
MVV Submit Environmental Permit application	Mar 2011	20th April 2011	Completed June 6th 2011	Delayed due to MVV finalisation of permit application
Planning Application Approval	Jan 2012	20th Jan 2012		It is hoped that application will be taken to a Planning Committee in December 2011
Planning JR period	N/A	20th April 2012		
Construction Start on Site	Apr 2012	27th April 2012		Subject to planning approval
Environmental Permit Application Approval	Mar 2012	Mid 2012		Permit not required until plant becomes operational hence not on critical path
Start of Hot Commissioning	Aug 2014	15th Sept 2012		MVV are anticipating receiving 100% of SWDWP waste soon after hot commissioning date
Operational Service	Nov 2014	25th Nov 2014		2014 operational date subject to receiving planning approval

This page is intentionally left blank